

# 1478-99-80-7 26-02-206 (227-65-227-63) International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda Tribunal pénal international pour le Rwanda



UNITED NATION NATION

OR: ENG

### TRIAL CHAMBER II

Before:

Judge Khalida Rachid Khan, Presiding

Judge Lee Gacuiga Muthoga Judge Emile Francis Short

Registrar:

Mr Adama Dieng

Date:

17 February 2006

### THE PROSECUTOR

CASIMIR BIZIMUNGU
JUSTIN MUGENZI
JÉRÔME-CLÉMENT BICAMUMPAKA
PROSPER MUGIRANEZA

Case No. ICTR-99-50-T

RECONSIDERATION OF DECISIONS ON PROTECTIVE MEASURES FOR DEFENCE WITNESSES PURSUANT TO APPEALS CHAMBER RULING OF 16 NOVEMBER 2005

#### Office of the Prosecutor:

Mr Paul Ng'arua

Mr Ibukunolu Babajide

Mr Justus Bwonwonga

Mr Elvis Bazawule

Mr George William Mugwanya

Mr Shyamlal Rajapaksa

### Counsel for the Defence:

Ms Michelyne C. St. Laurent and Ms Alexandra Marcil for Casimir Bizimungu

Mr Ben Gumpert and Mr. Jonathan Kirk for Justin Mugenzi

Mr Pierre Gaudreau and Mr Michel Croteau for Jérôme-Clément Bicamumpaka

Mr Tom Moran and Ms. Marie-Pierre Poulain for Prosper Mugiraneza

Jet -

## THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA ("Tribunal"),

SITTING as Trial Chamber II, composed of Judge Khalida Rachid Khan, Presiding, Judge Lee Gacuiga Muthoga and Judge Emile Francis Short (the "Trial Chamber");

**BEING SEIZED** of the "Decision on Prosecution Appeal of Witness Protection Measures", as rendered by the Appeals Chamber on 16 November 2005, in which the Appeals Chamber remitted the Impugned Decisions for reconsideration;

**RECALLING** that on 4 July 2005, the Prosecution filed its motion, pursuant to Rule 73(B) of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence of the Tribunal ("Rules") for certification to appeal a holding – repeated verbatim in each of the Impugned Decisions – that restricts disclosure of information pertaining to the identity of a protected witness to members of the "immediate Prosecution team" and not to anyone else within the Office of the Prosecutor; <sup>1</sup>

**RECALLING** that on 28 September 2005, the Chamber rendered its decision on the Prosecution's motion for certification, granting certification of the interlocutory appeal pursuant to Rule 73(B); <sup>2</sup>

CONSIDERING that the Chamber is directed to reconsider the Impugned Decisions in light of the Appeal Chamber's finding that a protective order restricting access to defence witness identities to a particular "Prosecution team" impermissibly contravenes the Prosecutor's obligation to disclose exculpatory material, pursuant to Rule 68 of the Rules, and that this obligation "rest[s] on him or her alone as an individual who is then able to authorize the Office of the Prosecutor as a whole, undivided unit, in fulfilling those obligations;"

### RECONSIDERING therefore, the

- i) "Decision on Casimir Bizimungu's Motion for Protection of Defence Witnesses;"
- ii) "Decision on Jerome Bicamumpaka's Motion for Protection of Defence Witnesses:"
- iii) "Decision on Justin Mugenzi's Confidential Motion for Protection of Defence Witnesses,"

as filed on 27 June 2005 (the "Impugned Decisions");

ALSO RECONSIDERING the "Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza's Motion for Protection of Defence Witnesses" of 2 February 2005, AND the "Decision on Prosecutor's Consolidated Corrigendum to Prosecutor's Response to Defence Motions for Protection of Defence Witnesses and Request for Reconsideration of Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza's Motion for Protection of Defence Witnesses", filed on 7 July 2005 (collectively, the "Mugiraneza Decision"), in the interest of ensuring that the protective measures ordered by the Chamber in respect of all Defence witnesses are uniformly worded and applied;

CONSIDERING the Statute of the Tribunai (the "Statute") and the Rules of Procedure and Evidence (the "Rules");

Jel-2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Prosecutor v. Bicimungu et al., Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, Prosecutor's Motion, Pursuant to Rule 73(B), for Certification to Appeal the Trial Chamber's Decisions on Motions for Protection of Defence Witnesses Dated 27 June 2005, 4 July 2005.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Prosecutor v. Bizimungu et al., Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, Decision on the Prosecutor's Motion for Certification to Appeal the Trial Chamber's Decisions on Protection of Defence Witnesses, 28 September 2005.

# HEREBY AMENDS the Impugned Decisions as follows:

22763

- i) Paragraph (e) of the Order in each of the Impugned Decisions is replaced with the following paragraph:
  - (e) The Prosecution shall not share, discuss, or reveal, directly or indirectly, any documents or any information contained in any documents, or any other information which could reveal or lead to the identification of any Defence witnesses to any person or entity outside the Office of the Prosecutor.
- ii) Paragraph (f) of the Order in each of the Impugned Decisions is deleted.

AND FURTHER ORDERS that the Protective Measures ordered in the Mugiraneza Decision be amended as per the above amendment of the Impugned Decisions.

Arusha, 17 February 2006

Khalida Rachid Khan Presiding Judge ee Gacuiga Muthoga Judge

Emile Francis Short Judge

17 February 2006