107R-01-76-7 28-10-2004 (2980 - 2978)



International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda Tribunal pénal international pour le Rwanda

2980 S. Mussa

**OR: ENG** 

# **TRIAL CHAMBER I**

Before: Judge Erik Møse, presiding Judge Sergei Alekseevich Egorov Judge Dennis C. M. Byron

Registrar: Adama Dieng

Date:

28 October 2004

JUDICIAL RECORDS/ARCHIVES 18 RECEIVED O 28 -r P  $\triangleright$ 

#### THE PROSECUTOR

v.

Aloys SIMBA

Case No. ICTR-01-76-T

# DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28

# Office of the Prosecutor:

Richard Karegyesa William T. Egbe Sulaiman Khan Ignacio Tredici Amina Ibrahim

<u>Counsel for the Defence</u> Sadikou Ayo Alao Beth Lyons

bh.

Prosecutor v. Aloys Simba, Case No. ICTR-01-76-T

# THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA ("the Tribunal");

SITTING as Trial Chamber I, composed of Judge Erik Møse, presiding, Judge Sergei Alekseevich Egorov, and Judge Dennis C. M. Byron;

**BEING SEIZED OF** the "Requête Urgente de la Défense en Vue d'Ordonner à l'Etat Rwandais Communication de l'Entier Dossier Judiciaire du Témoin KDD", filed on 27 October 2004;

HAVING HEARD the parties on 27 October 2004;

**HEREBY DECIDES** the motion.

## INTRODUCTION

1. The Defence seeks the entire judicial dossier of Prosecution Witness KDD. According to the parties, the witness is a detained witness who has been condemned to death in Rwanda. The Chamber has previously ordered the Prosecution to request the judicial records of its detained witnesses from the Rwandan authorities. The Prosecution disclosed the records it obtained to the Defence on 3 August and 1 September 2004. Two of these documents related to Witness KDD have been translated from Kinyarwanda into French and provided to the Defence, including a Pro Justitia statement dated 17 August 2001 and the record of the witness's guilty plea dated 26 January 2001.

### SUBMISSIONS

2. The Defence argues that it does not have any documentation relating to Witness KDD's death sentence, which prevents the full appreciation of the witnesses testimony. The Defence indicated without further detail that it explained its various efforts to obtain these documents during the status conference of 13 May 2004. The Defence indicated that the witnesses testimony should be postponed until these records are obtained.

3. The Prosecution states that it has complied the Chamber's order to request judicial records of its witnesses from the Rwandan authorities and that all the judicial records it received from them were disclosed to the Defence. The Defence has not adequately demonstrated that it has made its own good faith efforts to obtain the documents prior to making its request.

#### DELIBERATIONS

4. The Chamber has previously recognized that Rwandan judicial records are important for the preparations of the Defence given their relevance to credibility.<sup>1</sup> The Chamber recently stated in this case:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See, e.g., Simba, Decision on Defence Motion to Obtain Judicial Records Pursuant To Rule 68 (TC), 4 October 2004, para. 8; Bagosora et al., Decision on the Request for Documents Arising from Judicial Proceedings in Rwanda in Respect of Prosecution Witnesses (TC), 16 December 2003, para. 7; Bagilishema, Decision on the

#### Prosecutor v. Aloys Simba, Case No. ICTR-01-76-T

As is the general practice in the Tribunal, the Defence must first make its own independent efforts to secure evidence it wishes to use at trial other than exculpatory material in the possession of the Prosecution. Once the Defence demonstrates its inability to obtain relevant material despite its good faith efforts, it may then seize the Chamber and request appropriate judicial assistance pursuant to Article 28 of the Statute.<sup>2</sup>

5. The Chamber has reviewed the transcript from the 13 May 2003 status conference, which documents only the Defence's need for judicial documents, not their efforts to obtain them. Consequently, in the Chamber's view, the Defence has not adequately demonstrated the efforts that it has undertaken to obtain the requested documents. Absent such a showing, the Defence's request for cooperation is premature.

6. The request for the adjournment of the testimony of the witness until the Defence obtains the full judicial dossier is also denied. The Defence may draw the Chamber's attention to inconsistencies between the testimony of the witness before this Chamber and any declaration or record obtained subsequently.<sup>3</sup> If prejudice can be shown from its inability to put these inconsistencies to the witness, the Defence may submit a motion for his recall.

#### FOR THE ABOVE REASONS, THE CHAMBER

**DENIES** the Defence's motion.

Arusha, 28 October 2004

Erik Møse Presiding Judge

Serger Alekseevich Egorov Judge

Dennis C.M. Byron Judge

(Seal of the Tribunal)



Request of the Defence for an Order for Disclosure by the Prosecutor of the Admissions of Guilt of Witness Y, Z, and AA (TC), 8 June 2000, paras. 10-11.

<sup>2</sup> Simba, Decision on Defence Motion to Obtain Judicial Records Pursuant To Rule 68 (1C), 4 October 2004, para. 11 (internal citation omitted).

<sup>3</sup> Bagosora et al., Decisionon the Request for Documents Arising from Judicial Proceedings in Rwanda in Respect of Prosecution Witnesses (TC), 17 December 2004, para. 8.

3



# TRANSMISSION SHEET FOR FILING OF DOCUMENTS WITH CMS

COURT MANAGEMENT SECTION

(Art. 27 of the Directive for the Registry)

To:       Image: Section of the section o	I - GENERAL INFORMATION (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)					
JP. Fomété       M. Diop       K. K. A. Afande       R. Burriss         From:       Judges Mese, Egorov, Byron (names)       Defence       Prosecutor's Office       Other:         Judges Mese, Egorov, Byron (names)       (names)       (names)       (names)         Case Name:       Transmitted: 28 October 2004       Document's date: 28 October 2004         No. of Pages:       3       Ordginal Language:       English       French       Kinyarwanda         Title of Document:       DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 23       Submission from non-parise Strictly Confidential / Under Seal       Indictment       Warrant       Correspondence       Submission from non-parise Submission from parties         Strictly Confidential       Undersolation       Affiaavi       Notice of Appeal       Courseon dance       Submission from non-parise Submission from parties         Philoit       Disclosure       Order       Affiaavi       Notice of Appeal       Courseon dance         CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.       Strictly Confidential       Wotice of Appeal       Courseon for filling Set follows:	To:					
Judges Mess, (names)       (names)       (names)       (names)         Case Name:       The Proseculor vs. Simba       Case Number: ICTR-01-76-1         Dates:       Transmitted: 28 October 2004       Document's date: 28 October 2004         No. of Pages:       3       Original Language:       English       French       Kinyarwanda         Title of Document's date: 28 October 2004       Document's date: 28 October 2004       October 2004       Kinyarwanda         Classification Level:       Indictment       Warrant       Correspondence       Submission from non-parties         Confidential       Opecinon       Affidexti       Notice of Appeal       Submission from non-parties         Decision       Decision       Affidexti       Notice of Appeal       Submission from non-parties         Confidential       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)       CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.       Image: Appeal Book       Accused particulars         III - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)       CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.       Image Status       Image Status       Image Status         III - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be courespoint f						
Egorov, Byron (names)       (names)       (names)       (names)         Case Name:       The Proseculor vs. Simba       Case Number: ICTR-01-76-1         Dates:       Transmitted: 28 October 2004       Document's date: 28 October 2004         No. of Pages:       3       Original Language:       English       French       Kinyawanda         Title of Document:       DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN         Goordnential       Understand       Notion 1 Affidavit       Note of Appeal         Sticity Confidential       Understand       Affidavit       Note of Appeal         Public       Decision       Affidavit       Note of Authorities         II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)         CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.       Image: Case and and will not submit any translated version       Image: Case and and and will not submit any translated version         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing cas follows: Image: Case and	From:		Defence	Prosecutor's Office	Other:	
Dates:       Transmitted: 28 October 2004       Document's date: 28 October 2004         No. of Pages:       3       Original Language:       English       French       Kinyarwanda         Title of Document:       DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28         Classification Level:       Indictment Type:       Submission from non-parties         Confidential       Decision       Antioavin       Notice of Appeal       Submission from non-parties         Dublic       Indictment       Warrant       Correspondence       Submission from non-parties         Public       Indictment       Warrant       Ocrespondence       Accused particulars         Dublic       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         It - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)         CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.       French       Kinyarwanda         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing/gas follows:       French       Kinyarwanda         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       French       Kinyarwanda       French       Kinyarwanda         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       French       Kinyarwanda       French       Kinyarwan		Egorov, Byron (names)				
No. of Pages:       3       Original Language:       English       French       Kinyarwanda         Title of       DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28         Classification Level:       Indictment Type:       Submission from non-parties         Strictly Confidential / Under Seal       Indictment Type:       Submission from non-parties         Public       Decision       Afridavit       Notice of Appeal       Submission from non-parties         Public       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         Public       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         Motion       Book of Authorities       Indicavit       Motion       Book of Authorities         II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party       Filing Party Hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version.       Image: Submission from parties         GMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       Image: Submission for filing/gas follows: Image: Submit BOTH the original and the translated version for filing/gas follows: Image: Submit Status       Image: Submit Status         Original       in       English       French       Image: Submit Status         Translation       in       English       French <t< td=""><td>Case Name:</td><td colspan="4">The Prosecutor vs. Simba Case Number: ICTR-01-76-I</td></t<>	Case Name:	The Prosecutor vs. Simba Case Number: ICTR-01-76-I				
Title of Document:       DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28         Classification Level: Strictly Confidential / Under Seal Confidential Public       TRIM Document Type: Indictment @ Warrant       Correspondence       Submission from non-parties         Strictly Confidential Public       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         It - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book         It - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)       CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.       Image Language(s):       Image L				Document's date: 28 October 2004		
Document:       GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28         Classification Level:       Indictment       TRIM Document Type:       Submission from non-parties         Confidential       Indictment       Warrant       Correspondence       Submission from non-parties         Dublic       Decision       Addressi       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party Public       Data of the particulars       Discourse       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party Public       Data of the party       Party       Party         CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.       Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version.       Party       Party         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:       Party       Party       Party         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       French       Congenitation for filing as follows:       Party         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:       Congenitation for filing as follows:       Party         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       French       Congenitation for filing as follows: <th< td=""><td>No. of Pages:</td><td colspan="2">Oliginal Language.</td><td colspan="2"></td></th<>	No. of Pages:	Oliginal Language.				
Strictly Confidential / Under Seal       Indictment       Warrant       Correspondence       Submission from non-parties         Ordindential       Decision       Affidavit       Notice of Appeal       Submission from parties         Public       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars         II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party       Book of Authorities         III - TRANSLATION stratus on regarding translation.       Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version.       Filing Party hereby submits only the original and the translated version for filing as follows:         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       French       Kinyagwanda         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:       Kinyagwanda         Original       In       English       French         Filing Party will be submitting the translation.       Kinyagwanda       Kinyagwanda         Translation       In       English       French       Kinyagwand						
CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation.         Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version.         Reference material is provided in annex to facilitate translation.         Target Language(s):         English         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:         Original       In         English       French         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:         Original       In         English       French         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.         Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):         English       French         MiNDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW         The OTP is over-seeing translation.         The document is submitted for translation to:         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague.         Name of contact person:         Name of service:         Address:         E-mail / Tel. / Fax:         III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY)         III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION	Strictly Confidential / Under Seal       Indictment       Warrant       Correspondence       Submission from non-parties         Confidential       Decision       Affidavit       Notice of Appeal       Submission from parties         Public       Disclosure       Order       Appeal Book       Accused particulars					
Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version.       Image: Constraint of the constraint o	II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)					
CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       P         Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:       P         Original       In       English       French       Image and the translated version for filing as follows:       P         Original       In       English       French       Image and the translated version for filing as follows:       P         Original       In       English       French       Image and the translated version for filing as follows:       P         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       French       Image and the translated version for filing as followis:       P         Filing Party will be submitting the translated version (s) in due course in the following language(s):       Image and the translated version (s) in due course in the following language(s):       Image and translation.       Image and translation.         Filing Party will be submitting the translated version (s) in due course in the following language(s):       Image and translation.       Image and translation.         The OTP is over-seeing translation.       Image and translation.       Image and translation.       Image and translation.         The document is submitted for translation; see details below:       Image and translation (fees will be submitted to DCDMS):       Name of contact person:         Name of contact person:       Name of service:	<ul> <li>□ Reference material is provided in annex to facilitate translation.</li> <li>□ Target Language(s):</li> </ul>					
□ Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: □         □ Original       in       □ English       □ French       □ Kinyawanda         □ Translation       in       □ English       □ French       □ Kinyawanda         □ CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       □ Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):       □ Kinyarwanda         □ Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):       □ Kinyarwanda         □ Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):       □ Kinyarwanda         □ Berglish       □ French       □ Kinyarwanda <b>WINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW</b> □ DEFENCE is over-seeing translation.         □ The OTP is over-seeing translation to:       □ DEFENCE is over-seeing translation.         □ The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.       □ DEFENCE is over-seeing translation.         □ The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague.       Name of contact person:         □ An accredited service for translation; see details below:       Name of service:         □ Address:       E-mail / Tel. / Fax:         □ Tap priority       COMMENTS       □ Required date:         □ Top priority       □ Top priority       □ Required date: <td colspan="6"></td>						
Translation       in       English       French       Comparison         CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.       Filling Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):       Kinyarwanda         English       French       Kinyarwanda         MINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW       Kinyarwanda         The OTP is over-seeing translation to:       DEFENCE is over-seeing translation.         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.       DEFENCE is submitted to an accredited service for translation (fees will be submitted to DCDMS):         An accredited service for translation; see details below:       Name of contact person:         Name of service:       Address:         E-mail / Tel. / Fax:       E-mail / Tel. / Fax:         III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY)       Required date:         Urgent       Comments	Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:					
CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation.         Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):         English       French         KINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW         The OTP is over-seeing translation.         The document is submitted for translation to:         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague.         An accredited service for translation; see details below:         Name of contact person:         Name of service:         Address:         E-mail / Tel. / Fax:         III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY)         Top priority         COMMENTS         Required date:         Hearing date:						
Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):         English       French         KINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW         The OTP is over-seeing translation.         The document is submitted for translation to:         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague.         An accredited service for translation; see details below:         Name of contact person:         Name of service:         Address:         E-mail / Tel. / Fax:         III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY)         Top priority         COMMENTS         Required date:         Hearing date:	Translation					
The OTP is over-seeing translation.       DEFENCE is over-seeing translation.         The document is submitted for translation to:       The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague.       The document is submitted to DCDMS):         An accredited service for translation; see details below:       Name of contact person:         Name of service:       Address:         E-mail / Tel. / Fax:       E-mail / Tel. / Fax:         III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY)         Top priority       COMMENTS         Ourgent       Required date:	<ul> <li>Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s):</li> <li>English</li> <li>French</li> <li>Kinyarwanda</li> </ul>					
The document is submitted for translation to:       The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.         The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague.       The document is submitted to DCDMS):         An accredited service for translation; see details below:       Name of contact person:         Name of service:       Address:         E-mail / Tel. / Fax:       E-mail / Tel. / Fax:         III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY)       Required date:         Urgent       Image date:						
III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY)         Top priority       COMMENTS       Required date:         Urgent       Image: Ima	<ul> <li>The document is submitted for translation to:</li> <li>The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha.</li> <li>The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague.</li> <li>An accredited service for translation; see details below:</li> <li>Name of contact person:</li> <li>Name of service:</li> <li>Address:</li> </ul>			The document is submitted to an accredited service for translation (fees will be submitted to DCDMS): Name of contact person: Name of service: Address:		
COMMENTS       Required date:         Urgent       Hearing date:						
Urgent Hearing date:						
	Top priority		COMMENTS		Required date:	
Normal     Other deadlines:	Urgent				Hearing date:	