107R-01-76-7 28-10-2004 (2980 - 2978)



International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda Tribunal pénal international pour le Rwanda

2980 S. Mussa

OR: ENG

TRIAL CHAMBER I

Before: Judge Erik Møse, presiding Judge Sergei Alekseevich Egorov Judge Dennis C. M. Byron

Registrar: Adama Dieng

Date:

28 October 2004

JUDICIAL RECORDS/ARCHIVES 18 RECEIVED O 28 -r P \triangleright

THE PROSECUTOR

v.

Aloys SIMBA

Case No. ICTR-01-76-T

DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28

Office of the Prosecutor:

Richard Karegyesa William T. Egbe Sulaiman Khan Ignacio Tredici Amina Ibrahim

<u>Counsel for the Defence</u> Sadikou Ayo Alao Beth Lyons

bh.

Prosecutor v. Aloys Simba, Case No. ICTR-01-76-T

THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL FOR RWANDA ("the Tribunal");

SITTING as Trial Chamber I, composed of Judge Erik Møse, presiding, Judge Sergei Alekseevich Egorov, and Judge Dennis C. M. Byron;

BEING SEIZED OF the "Requête Urgente de la Défense en Vue d'Ordonner à l'Etat Rwandais Communication de l'Entier Dossier Judiciaire du Témoin KDD", filed on 27 October 2004;

HAVING HEARD the parties on 27 October 2004;

HEREBY DECIDES the motion.

INTRODUCTION

1. The Defence seeks the entire judicial dossier of Prosecution Witness KDD. According to the parties, the witness is a detained witness who has been condemned to death in Rwanda. The Chamber has previously ordered the Prosecution to request the judicial records of its detained witnesses from the Rwandan authorities. The Prosecution disclosed the records it obtained to the Defence on 3 August and 1 September 2004. Two of these documents related to Witness KDD have been translated from Kinyarwanda into French and provided to the Defence, including a Pro Justitia statement dated 17 August 2001 and the record of the witness's guilty plea dated 26 January 2001.

SUBMISSIONS

2. The Defence argues that it does not have any documentation relating to Witness KDD's death sentence, which prevents the full appreciation of the witnesses testimony. The Defence indicated without further detail that it explained its various efforts to obtain these documents during the status conference of 13 May 2004. The Defence indicated that the witnesses testimony should be postponed until these records are obtained.

3. The Prosecution states that it has complied the Chamber's order to request judicial records of its witnesses from the Rwandan authorities and that all the judicial records it received from them were disclosed to the Defence. The Defence has not adequately demonstrated that it has made its own good faith efforts to obtain the documents prior to making its request.

DELIBERATIONS

4. The Chamber has previously recognized that Rwandan judicial records are important for the preparations of the Defence given their relevance to credibility.¹ The Chamber recently stated in this case:

¹ See, e.g., Simba, Decision on Defence Motion to Obtain Judicial Records Pursuant To Rule 68 (TC), 4 October 2004, para. 8; Bagosora et al., Decision on the Request for Documents Arising from Judicial Proceedings in Rwanda in Respect of Prosecution Witnesses (TC), 16 December 2003, para. 7; Bagilishema, Decision on the

Prosecutor v. Aloys Simba, Case No. ICTR-01-76-T

As is the general practice in the Tribunal, the Defence must first make its own independent efforts to secure evidence it wishes to use at trial other than exculpatory material in the possession of the Prosecution. Once the Defence demonstrates its inability to obtain relevant material despite its good faith efforts, it may then seize the Chamber and request appropriate judicial assistance pursuant to Article 28 of the Statute.²

5. The Chamber has reviewed the transcript from the 13 May 2003 status conference, which documents only the Defence's need for judicial documents, not their efforts to obtain them. Consequently, in the Chamber's view, the Defence has not adequately demonstrated the efforts that it has undertaken to obtain the requested documents. Absent such a showing, the Defence's request for cooperation is premature.

6. The request for the adjournment of the testimony of the witness until the Defence obtains the full judicial dossier is also denied. The Defence may draw the Chamber's attention to inconsistencies between the testimony of the witness before this Chamber and any declaration or record obtained subsequently.³ If prejudice can be shown from its inability to put these inconsistencies to the witness, the Defence may submit a motion for his recall.

FOR THE ABOVE REASONS, THE CHAMBER

DENIES the Defence's motion.

Arusha, 28 October 2004

Erik Møse Presiding Judge

Serger Alekseevich Egorov Judge

Dennis C.M. Byron Judge

(Seal of the Tribunal)



Request of the Defence for an Order for Disclosure by the Prosecutor of the Admissions of Guilt of Witness Y, Z, and AA (TC), 8 June 2000, paras. 10-11.

² Simba, Decision on Defence Motion to Obtain Judicial Records Pursuant To Rule 68 (1C), 4 October 2004, para. 11 (internal citation omitted).

³ Bagosora et al., Decisionon the Request for Documents Arising from Judicial Proceedings in Rwanda in Respect of Prosecution Witnesses (TC), 17 December 2004, para. 8.

3



TRANSMISSION SHEET FOR FILING OF DOCUMENTS WITH CMS

COURT MANAGEMENT SECTION

(Art. 27 of the Directive for the Registry)

To: Image: Section of the section o	I - GENERAL INFORMATION (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)					
JP. Fomété M. Diop K. K. A. Afande R. Burriss From: Judges Mese, Egorov, Byron (names) Defence Prosecutor's Office Other: Judges Mese, Egorov, Byron (names) (names) (names) (names) Case Name: Transmitted: 28 October 2004 Document's date: 28 October 2004 No. of Pages: 3 Ordginal Language: English French Kinyarwanda Title of Document: DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 23 Submission from non-parise Strictly Confidential / Under Seal Indictment Warrant Correspondence Submission from non-parise Submission from parties Strictly Confidential Undersolation Affiaavi Notice of Appeal Courseon dance Submission from non-parise Submission from parties Philoit Disclosure Order Affiaavi Notice of Appeal Courseon dance CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. Strictly Confidential Wotice of Appeal Courseon for filling Set follows:	To:					
Judges Mess, (names) (names) (names) (names) Case Name: The Proseculor vs. Simba Case Number: ICTR-01-76-1 Dates: Transmitted: 28 October 2004 Document's date: 28 October 2004 No. of Pages: 3 Original Language: English French Kinyarwanda Title of Document's date: 28 October 2004 Document's date: 28 October 2004 October 2004 Kinyarwanda Classification Level: Indictment Warrant Correspondence Submission from non-parties Confidential Opecinon Affidexti Notice of Appeal Submission from non-parties Decision Decision Affidexti Notice of Appeal Submission from non-parties Confidential Disclosure Order Appeal Book Accused particulars II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party) CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. Image: Appeal Book Accused particulars III - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party) CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. Image Status Image Status Image Status III - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be courespoint f						
Egorov, Byron (names) (names) (names) (names) Case Name: The Proseculor vs. Simba Case Number: ICTR-01-76-1 Dates: Transmitted: 28 October 2004 Document's date: 28 October 2004 No. of Pages: 3 Original Language: English French Kinyawanda Title of Document: DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN Goordnential Understand Notion 1 Affidavit Note of Appeal Sticity Confidential Understand Affidavit Note of Appeal Public Decision Affidavit Note of Authorities II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party) CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. Image: Case and and will not submit any translated version Image: Case and and and will not submit any translated version Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing cas follows: Image: Case and	From:		Defence	Prosecutor's Office	Other:	
Dates: Transmitted: 28 October 2004 Document's date: 28 October 2004 No. of Pages: 3 Original Language: English French Kinyarwanda Title of Document: DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28 Classification Level: Indictment Type: Submission from non-parties Confidential Decision Antioavin Notice of Appeal Submission from non-parties Dublic Indictment Warrant Correspondence Submission from non-parties Public Indictment Warrant Ocrespondence Accused particulars Dublic Disclosure Order Appeal Book Accused particulars It - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party) CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. French Kinyarwanda Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing/gas follows: French Kinyarwanda CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. French Kinyarwanda French Kinyarwanda CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. French Kinyarwanda French Kinyarwan		Egorov, Byron (names)				
No. of Pages: 3 Original Language: English French Kinyarwanda Title of DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28 Classification Level: Indictment Type: Submission from non-parties Strictly Confidential / Under Seal Indictment Type: Submission from non-parties Public Decision Afridavit Notice of Appeal Submission from non-parties Public Disclosure Order Appeal Book Accused particulars Public Disclosure Order Appeal Book Accused particulars Motion Book of Authorities Indicavit Motion Book of Authorities II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party Filing Party Hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version. Image: Submission from parties GMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. Image: Submission for filing/gas follows: Image: Submit BOTH the original and the translated version for filing/gas follows: Image: Submit Status Image: Submit Status Original in English French Image: Submit Status Translation in English French <t< td=""><td>Case Name:</td><td colspan="4">The Prosecutor vs. Simba Case Number: ICTR-01-76-I</td></t<>	Case Name:	The Prosecutor vs. Simba Case Number: ICTR-01-76-I				
Title of Document: DECISION ON THE DEFENCE REQUEST FOR THE COOPERATION OF RWANDAN GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28 Classification Level: Strictly Confidential / Under Seal Confidential Public TRIM Document Type: Indictment @ Warrant Correspondence Submission from non-parties Strictly Confidential Public Disclosure Order Appeal Book Accused particulars It - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party) Disclosure Order Appeal Book It - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party) CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. Image Language(s): Image L				Document's date: 28 October 2004		
Document: GOVERNMENT PURSUANT TO ARTICLE 28 Classification Level: Indictment TRIM Document Type: Submission from non-parties Confidential Indictment Warrant Correspondence Submission from non-parties Dublic Decision Addressi Appeal Book Accused particulars II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party Public Data of the particulars Discourse Order Appeal Book Accused particulars II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party Public Data of the party Party Party CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version. Party Party Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: Party Party Party CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. French Congenitation for filing as follows: Party Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: Congenitation for filing as follows: Party CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. French Congenitation for filing as follows: <th< td=""><td>No. of Pages:</td><td colspan="2">Oliginal Language.</td><td colspan="2"></td></th<>	No. of Pages:	Oliginal Language.				
Strictly Confidential / Under Seal Indictment Warrant Correspondence Submission from non-parties Ordindential Decision Affidavit Notice of Appeal Submission from parties Public Disclosure Order Appeal Book Accused particulars II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party Book of Authorities III - TRANSLATION stratus on regarding translation. Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version. Filing Party hereby submits only the original and the translated version for filing as follows: CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. French Kinyagwanda Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: Kinyagwanda Original In English French Filing Party will be submitting the translation. Kinyagwanda Kinyagwanda Translation In English French Kinyagwand						
CMS SHALL take necessary action regarding translation. Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version. Reference material is provided in annex to facilitate translation. Target Language(s): English Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: Original In English French CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: Original In English French CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): English French MiNDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW The OTP is over-seeing translation. The document is submitted for translation to: The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague. Name of contact person: Name of service: Address: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY) III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION	Strictly Confidential / Under Seal Indictment Warrant Correspondence Submission from non-parties Confidential Decision Affidavit Notice of Appeal Submission from parties Public Disclosure Order Appeal Book Accused particulars					
Filing Party hereby submits only the original, and will not submit any translated version. Image: Constraint of the constraint o	II - TRANSLATION STATUS ON THE FILING DATE (To be completed by the Chambers / Filing Party)					
CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. P Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: P Original In English French Image and the translated version for filing as follows: P Original In English French Image and the translated version for filing as follows: P Original In English French Image and the translated version for filing as follows: P CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. French Image and the translated version for filing as followis: P Filing Party will be submitting the translated version (s) in due course in the following language(s): Image and the translated version (s) in due course in the following language(s): Image and translation. Image and translation. Filing Party will be submitting the translated version (s) in due course in the following language(s): Image and translation. Image and translation. The OTP is over-seeing translation. Image and translation. Image and translation. Image and translation. The document is submitted for translation; see details below: Image and translation (fees will be submitted to DCDMS): Name of contact person: Name of contact person: Name of service:	 □ Reference material is provided in annex to facilitate translation. □ Target Language(s): 					
□ Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows: □ □ Original in □ English □ French □ Kinyawanda □ Translation in □ English □ French □ Kinyawanda □ CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. □ Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): □ Kinyarwanda □ Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): □ Kinyarwanda □ Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): □ Kinyarwanda □ Berglish □ French □ Kinyarwanda WINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW □ DEFENCE is over-seeing translation. □ The OTP is over-seeing translation to: □ DEFENCE is over-seeing translation. □ The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. □ DEFENCE is over-seeing translation. □ The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague. Name of contact person: □ An accredited service for translation; see details below: Name of service: □ Address: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: □ Tap priority COMMENTS □ Required date: □ Top priority □ Top priority □ Required date: <td colspan="6"></td>						
Translation in English French Comparison CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. Filling Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): Kinyarwanda English French Kinyarwanda MINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW Kinyarwanda The OTP is over-seeing translation to: DEFENCE is over-seeing translation. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. DEFENCE is submitted to an accredited service for translation (fees will be submitted to DCDMS): An accredited service for translation; see details below: Name of contact person: Name of service: Address: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY) Required date: Urgent Comments	Filing Party hereby submits BOTH the original and the translated version for filing as follows:					
CMS SHALL NOT take any action regarding translation. Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): English French KINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW The OTP is over-seeing translation. The document is submitted for translation to: The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague. An accredited service for translation; see details below: Name of contact person: Name of service: Address: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY) Top priority COMMENTS Required date: Hearing date:						
Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): English French KINDLY FILL IN THE BOXES BELOW The OTP is over-seeing translation. The document is submitted for translation to: The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague. An accredited service for translation; see details below: Name of contact person: Name of service: Address: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY) Top priority COMMENTS Required date: Hearing date:	Translation					
The OTP is over-seeing translation. DEFENCE is over-seeing translation. The document is submitted for translation to: The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague. The document is submitted to DCDMS): An accredited service for translation; see details below: Name of contact person: Name of service: Address: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY) Top priority COMMENTS Ourgent Required date:	 Filing Party will be submitting the translated version(s) in due course in the following language(s): English French Kinyarwanda 					
The document is submitted for translation to: The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague. The document is submitted to DCDMS): An accredited service for translation; see details below: Name of contact person: Name of service: Address: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: E-mail / Tel. / Fax: III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY) Required date: Urgent Image date:						
III - TRANSLATION PRIORITISATION (For Official use ONLY) Top priority COMMENTS Required date: Urgent Image: Ima	 The document is submitted for translation to: The Language Services Section of the ICTR / Arusha. The Language Services Section of the ICTR / The Hague. An accredited service for translation; see details below: Name of contact person: Name of service: Address: 			The document is submitted to an accredited service for translation (fees will be submitted to DCDMS): Name of contact person: Name of service: Address:		
COMMENTS Required date: Urgent Hearing date:						
Urgent Hearing date:						
	Top priority		COMMENTS		Required date:	
Normal Other deadlines:	Urgent				Hearing date:	