

**អត្ថមុះេះ**នុំ៩ទ្រះ Pre-Trial Chamber Chambre Preliminaire

#### ි ලාංහ සිංහා ස සිංහා සිංහ සිංහා සිංහ සිංහා සිංහ සිංහා සිංහ

Kingdom of Cambodia Nation Religion King Royaume du Cambodge Nation Religion Roi

D359/3/3

In the name of the Cambodian people and the United Nations and pursuant to the Law on the Establishment of the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia for the Prosecution of Crimes Committed During the Period of Democratic Kampuchea

Case File Nº 004/2/07-09-2009-ECCC/OCIJ

# THE PRE-TRIAL CHAMBER

**Before:** 

Date:

Judge PRAK Kimsan, President Judge Olivier BEAUVALLET Judge NEY Thol Judge Kang Jin BAIK Judge HUOT Vuthy

22 January 2019

<b>ນ</b> ສຸສາເຊີຮ
ORIGINAL DOCUMENT/DOCUMENT ORIGINAL
ໄຢ ໃສ່ ຢູ່າ ສຣູເບ (Date of receipt/date de recer on): 
1918 (Time/Heure):
ទន្ត្រីទទួលបន្តកសំណុំរឿង /Case File Officer/L'ageni chargé du dossier: SANN RADA

## PUBLIC

#### DECISION ON REQUESTS FOR EXTENSION OF TIME AND PAGE LIMITS FOR RESPONSES AND REPLIES RELATING TO THE APPEALS AGAINST THE CLOSING ORDERS IN CASE 004/2

#### **Co-Prosecutors**

CHEA Leang Nicholas KOUMJIAN

Co-Lawyers for

MOM Luch Richard ROGERS Göran SLUITER

## Civil Party Lawyers

CHET Vanly HONG Kimsuon KIM Mengkhy LOR Chumthy SAM Sokong SIN Soworn TY Srinna VEN Pov

Laure DESFORGES Isabelle DURAND Emmanuel JACOMY Martine JACQUIN Daniel MCLAUGHLIN Nushin SARKARATI



ន្លូវជាតិលេខ៩ ស/ក ចោមនៅ ខណ្ឌពោធិ៍សែងជ័យ ភ្នំពេញ ប្រដាប់សំបុត្រ ៧១ ទូវស័ព្ទ (៨៩៥) ២៣-២១៩-៨១៩ ទូវសារ (៨៥៥) ២៣-២១៩-៨៩១ ពេហទំព័រ www.eccc.gov.kh National Road 4, Chaom Chau, Porsenchey, PO Box 71, Phnom Penh. Cambodia Tel: (855) 023 219 814 Fax: (855) 023 219 841 Web: www.eccc.gov.kh

1

**THE PRE-TRIAL CHAMBER** of the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia is seised of "**Constant**" is Request for Extension of Time and Page Limits for His Response to the International Co-Prosecutor's Appeal of the Order Dismissing the Case Against **Constant**" (D359) and any Related Replies" dated 10 January 2019<sup>1</sup> and of the "International Co-Prosecutor's Extension Request for His Response and Reply Relating to the Appeals in Case 004/2" dated 11 January 2019<sup>2</sup> (collectively "Requests").

1. On 16 August 2018, the International Co-Investigating Judge issued a Closing Order (Indictment)<sup>3</sup> and the National Co-Investigating Judge issued a Closing Order (Dismissal).<sup>4</sup> On 8 November 2018, the Pre-Trial Chamber extended the time and page limits for the filing of appeals against the Closing Orders.<sup>5</sup> On 14 December 2018, the National Co-Prosecutor filed an appeal in Khmer against the Closing Order (Indictment) ("National Co-Prosecutor's Appeal).<sup>6</sup> On 20 December 2018, the Co-Lawyers for **Example** ("Co-Lawyers") and the International Co-Prosecutor respectively filed appeals in English against the Closing Order (Indictment) ("International Co-Prosecutor's Appeal").<sup>8</sup> On 10 and 11 January 2019, pursuant to the Pre-Trial Chamber's instructions, the Co-Lawyers and the International Co-Prosecutor filed the Requests.

2. The Co-Lawyers request the authorisation to file a 45-page response to the International-Co Prosecutor's Appeal within 35 days from notification of its translation and a 15-page reply to any response to **Example**'s Appeal within 15 days from notification of its translation.<sup>9</sup> They submit that the requested extensions are necessary in order to preserve

Decision on Requests for Extension of Time and Page Limits for Responses and Replies Relating to the Appeals Against the Closing Orders in Case 004/2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Case 004/2/07-09-2009-ECCC/OCIJ ("Case 004/2), **Second**'s Request for Extension of Time and Page Limits for His Response to the International Co-Prosecutor's Appeal of the Order Dismissing the Case Against (D359) and any Related Replies, 10 January 2019, D359/3/2 ("**Case 1**"'s Request").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Case 004/2, International Co-Prosecutor's Extension Request for His Response and Reply Relating to the Appeals in Case 004/2, 11 January 2019, D360/5/2 ("International Co-Prosecutor's Request").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Case 004/2, Closing Order (Indictment), 16 August 2018, D360.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Case 004/2, Order Dismissing the Case Against **16** August 2018, D359.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Case 004/2, Decision on Request for Extension of Time and Page Limit for **Second Page** 's Appeal Against the Closing Order (Indictment), 8 November 2008, D360/7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Case 004/2, National Co-Prosecutor's Appeal Against the International Co-Investigating Judge's Closing Order (Indictment), 14 December 2018, D360/8/1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Case 004/2, **Construction**'s Appeal Against the International Co-Investigating Judge's Closing Order (Indictment), 20 December 2018, D360/5/1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Case 004/2, International Co-Prosecutor's Appeal of the Order Dismissing the Case Against (D359), 20 December 2018, D359/3/1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> 's Request, para. 22.

2

's fundamental right to an effective defence, notably in view of the lengths of the appeals and the number of appeal grounds raising a broad range of complex legal and factual issues.<sup>10</sup> They further ask permission to file their response and reply in English first, with Khmer translation to be filed at the earliest opportunity.<sup>11</sup>

3. The International Co-Prosecutor requests the authorisation to file an 80-page consolidated response to the **1** 's and the National Co-Prosecutor's Appeals, as well as a 45-page consolidated reply to any response regarding his Appeal, respectively within 30 and 15 days from notification of translation of the Appeals and response(s).<sup>12</sup> He submits that such extensions are essential considering the length of **1** 's appeal and annexes, the alleged errors concerning the facts and standard of proof, and the novel legal issues that need to be addressed.<sup>13</sup> He further requests permission to file in English first, with Khmer translation to follow.<sup>14</sup> Finally, he solicits leave to revisit the issue of time and page limits to reply, if necessary, after the responses are filed.<sup>15</sup>

4. Pursuant to Internal Rules 39(2) and (4), the Pre-Trial Chamber may set and/or extend any time limits for the filing of documents relating to an appeal. It may also, based on Article 5(4) of the Practice Direction on Filing of Documents, extend the page limit of a document in exceptional circumstances.

5. At the outset, the Pre-Trial Chamber considers that authorising the filing of consolidated responses and replies is not appropriate in the present case and that the parties should address each appeal and response individually. Turning to the page and time limits, the Pre-Trial Chamber finds it justified, in light of the length and complexity of the Appeals, and in order to balance fair trial rights and efficiency, to grant all parties an extension of 20 pages and 20 days to file their responses, and of 10 days to file replies, with time limits running from the notification of translation of each appeal and response. No further extension will be granted.

Decision on Requests for Extension of Time and Page Limits for Responses and Replies Relating to the Appeals Against the Closing Orders in Case 004/2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> 's Request, paras 19-21.

s Request, para. 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> International Co-Prosecutor's Request, para. 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> International Co-Prosecutor's Request, paras 12-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> International Co-Prosecutor's Request, para. 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> International Co-Prosecutor's Request, paras 17-18.

#### FOR THESE REASONS, THE PRE-TRIAL CHAMBER UNANIMOUSLY HEREBY:

**GRANTS** the Requests in part;

ALLOWS the parties to file 50-page responses within 30 days from the notification of translation of each Appeal;

ALLOWS the parties to file 30-page replies within 15 days from the notification of translation of each response;

ALLOWS the parties to file responses and replies in one language with translation to follow;

INSTRUCTS the ITU to ensure that requested translations are issued within 20 days from the filing of the responses and 15 days from the filing of the replies;

**DENIES** the remainder of the Requests.

In accordance with Internal Rule 77(13), this decision is not subject to appeal.

Phnom Penh, 22 January 2019

**Pre-Trial Chamber** 

President PRAK Kimsan Olivier BEAUVALLET NEY Thol Kang Jin BAIK HUOT Vuthy dia BER

Decision on Requests for Extension of Time and Page Limits for Responses and Replies Relating to the Appeals Against the Closing Orders in Case 004/2